

1 JEFF JACKSON

Attorney General for the State of North Carolina

2 Tracy Nayer (NC Bar No. 36964)

3 Rochelle Sparko (NC Bar No. 38528)

Special Deputy Attorneys General

4 North Carolina Department of Justice

Consumer Protection Division

5 P.O. Box 629

6 Raleigh, North Carolina 27602

Phone: (919) 716-6000

7 Fax: (919) 716-6050

8 tnayer@ncdoj.gov

rsparko@ncdoj.gov

9 *Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs*

10
11 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
12 **FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**
13

14
15 State of Arizona, *ex rel.* Kristin K. Mayes,
16 Attorney General; et al.,

17 Plaintiffs,

18 v.

19 Michael D. Lansky, L.L.C., dba Avid
20 Telecom; et al.,

21 Defendants.
22

NO. 4:23-cv-00233-TUC-CKJ

**NOTICE OF SERVICE OF
PLAINTIFFS' REBUTTAL
EXPERT TESTIMONY**

23
24 Pursuant to LRCiv 5.2, Plaintiffs notice the Court that, on November 17, 2025,
25 Plaintiffs served counsel of record for Defendants with the following disclosure of Rebuttal
26 Expert Testimony in accordance with Rule 5(b)(1) and (b)(2)(E) of the Fed. R. Civ. P.:
27
28

- Volume AGTF_VOL010 Document Production (between and including Bates Nos. AGTF_000156345 and AGTF_000156630) included:
 - A rebuttal expert report and accompanying declaration prepared by Mike Rudolph, Chief Technology Officer for YouMail and an executive leader of the YouMail Investigative Services team;
 - A rebuttal expert report with a declaration prepared by Joshua M. Bercu, Executive Director of the Industry Traceback Group; and
 - Additional supporting documents for the rebuttal expert reports from Messrs. Rudolph and Bercu.

The remainder of this page is intentionally left blank.

1 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 24th day of November, 2025.

2
3 **FOR THE STATE OF ARIZONA:**

4
5 KRISTIN K. MAYES
6 Attorney General for the State of Arizona

7 /s/ John Raymond Dillon IV
8 JOHN RAYMOND DILLON IV
9 SARAH PELTON
10 Assistant Attorneys General
11 *Attorneys for the State of Arizona*

**FOR THE STATE OF NORTH
CAROLINA:**

JEFF JACKSON
Attorney General for the State of North
Carolina

/s/ Tracy Nayer
TRACY NAYER
ROCHELLE SPARKO
Special Deputy Attorneys General
Attorneys for the State of North Carolina

12 **FOR THE STATE OF INDIANA:**

13 TODD ROKITA
14 Attorney General for the State of Indiana

15 /s/ Douglas S. Swetnam
16 DOUGLAS S. SWETNAM
17 THOMAS L. MARTINDALE
18 Deputy Attorneys General
Attorneys for the State of Indiana

FOR THE STATE OF OHIO:

DAVE YOST
Attorney General for the State of Ohio

/s/ Erin B. Leahy
ERIN B. LEAHY
EMILY G. DIETZ
Assistant Attorneys General
Attorneys for the State of Ohio

19
20 *Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs*
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on November 24, 2025, I caused the foregoing **NOTICE OF SERVICE OF PLAINTIFFS' REBUTTAL EXPERT TESTIMONY** to be filed and served electronically via the Court's CM/ECF system upon counsel of record.

/s/ Tracy Nayer
Special Deputy Attorney General
Counsel for the Plaintiff State of North Carolina

LIST OF PLAINTIFFS' COUNSEL

John Raymond Dillon IV (AZ Bar
No. 036796)

Sarah Pelton (AZ Bar No. 039633)
Assistant Attorneys General
Arizona Attorney General's Office
2005 North Central Avenue

Phoenix, AZ 85004

Phone: (602) 542-8018

Fax: (602) 542-4377

john.dillonIV@azag.gov

sarah.pelton@azag.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Arizona

Tracy Nayer (NC Bar No. 36964)

Rochelle Sparko (NC Bar No. 38528)

Special Deputy Attorneys General

North Carolina Department of Justice

Consumer Protection Division

P.O. Box 629

Raleigh, North Carolina 27602

Phone: (919) 716-6000

Fax: (919) 716-6050

tnayer@ncdoj.gov

rsparko@ncdoj.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of North
Carolina*

Douglas S. Swetnam (IN Bar No. 15860-
49)

Thomas L. Martindale (IN Bar No. 29706-
64)

Deputy Attorneys General

Office of the Indiana Attorney General

Todd Rokita

Indiana Govt. Center South, 5th Fl.

302 W. Washington St.

Indianapolis, IN 46204-2770

Phone: (317) 232-6294 (Swetnam)

(317) 232-7751 (Martindale)

Fax: (317) 232-7979

douglas.swetnam@atg.in.gov

thomas.martindale@atg.in.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Indiana

Erin B. Leahy (OH Bar No. 0069509)

Emily G. Dietz (OH Bar No. 0104729)

Assistant Attorneys General

Office of Attorney General Dave Yost

30 East Broad Street, 14th Fl.

Columbus, OH 43215

Phone: (614) 752-4730 (Leahy)

(614) 466-3493 (Dietz)

Erin.Leahy@OhioAGO.gov

Emily.Dietz@OhioAGO.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Ohio

Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs

Lindsay D. Barton (AL Bar No. 1165-G00N)
 Robert D. Tambling (AL Bar No. 6026-N67R)
 Assistant Attorneys General
 Office of the Alabama Attorney General
 501 Washington Avenue
 Montgomery, Alabama 36130
 Phone: (334) 353-2609 (Barton)
 (334) 242-7445 (Tambling)
 Fax: (334) 353-8400
Lindsay.Barton@AlabamaAG.gov
Robert.Tambling@AlabamaAG.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Alabama

Amanda Wentz (AR Bar No. 2021066)
 Assistant Attorney General
 Office of Attorney General Tim Griffin
 101 West Capitol Avenue
 Little Rock, AR 72201
 Phone: (501) 682-1178
 Fax: (501) 682-8118
amanda.wentz@arkansasag.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Arkansas

Nicklas A. Akers (CA Bar No. 211222)
 Senior Assistant Attorney General
 Bernard A. Eskandari (CA Bar No. 244395)
 Supervising Deputy Attorney General
 Timothy D. Lundgren (CA Bar No. 254596)
 Rosailda Perez (CA Bar No. 284646)
 Deputy Attorneys General
 Office of the California Attorney General
 300 S. Spring St., Suite 1702
 Los Angeles, CA 90013
 Phone: (415) 510-3364 (Akers)
 (213) 269-6348 (Eskandari)
 (213) 269-6355 (Lundgren)
 (213) 269-6612 (Perez)
 Fax: (916) 731-2146
nicklas.akers@doj.ca.gov
bernard.eskandari@doj.ca.gov
timothy.lundgren@doj.ca.gov
rosailda.perez@doj.ca.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff People of the State of California

Michel Singer Nelson (CO Bar No. 19779)
 Assistant Attorney General II
 Colorado Office of the Attorney General
 Ralph L. Carr Judicial Building
 1300 Broadway, 10th Floor
 Denver, CO 80203
 Phone: (720) 508-6220
michel.singernelson@coag.gov
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of Colorado,
 ex rel. Philip J. Weiser, Attorney General*

1 Brendan T. Flynn (Fed. Bar No. ct04545,
2 CT Bar No. 419935)
3 Assistant Attorney General
4 Office of the Connecticut Attorney
5 General William Tong
6 165 Capitol Avenue, Suite 4000
7 Hartford, CT 06106
8 Phone: (860) 808-5400
9 Fax: (860) 808-5593
10 brendan.flynn@ct.gov
11 *Attorney for Plaintiff State of Connecticut*

12 Ryan Costa (DE Bar No. 5325)
13 Deputy Attorney General
14 Delaware Department of Justice
15 820 N. French Street, 5th Floor
16 Wilmington, DE 19801
17 Phone: (302) 683-8811
18 Fax: (302) 577-6499
19 Ryan.costa@delaware.gov
20 *Attorney for Plaintiff State of Delaware*

21 Laura C. Beckerman (DC Bar No.
22 1008120)
23 Senior Trial Counsel
24 Public Advocacy Division
25 D.C. Office of the Attorney General
26 400 6th Street NW, 10th Floor
27 Washington, DC 20001
28 Phone: (202) 655-7906
Laura.Beckerman@dc.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff District of Columbia

Sean P. Saval (FL Bar No. 96500)
Sr. Assistant Attorney General
Michael P. Roland (FL Bar No. 44856)
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Florida Attorney General
Department of Legal Affairs
Consumer Protection Division
3507 E. Frontage Rd, Suite 325
Tampa, FL 33607
Phone: (813) 287-7950
Fax: (813) 281-5515
Sean.Saval@myfloridalegal.com
michael.roland@myfloridalegal.com
Zivile.Rimkevicius@myfloridalegal.com
*Attorneys for Plaintiff James Uthmeier,
Attorney General of the State of Florida*

David A. Zisook (GA Bar No. 310104)
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Georgia Attorney General
40 Capitol Square SW
Atlanta, GA 30334
Phone: (404) 458-4294
Fax: (404) 464-8212
dzisook@law.ga.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Georgia

Christopher J.I. Leong (HI Bar No. 9662)
Deputy Attorney General
Hawaii Department of the Attorney
General
425 Queen Street
Honolulu, HI 96813
Phone: (808) 586-1180
Fax: (808) 586-1205
christopher.ji.leong@hawaii.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Hawaii

James J. Simeri (ID Bar No. 12332)
 Consumer Protection Division Chief
 Idaho Attorney General's Office
 P.O. Box 83720
 Boise, ID 83720-0010
 Phone: (208) 334-4114
james.simeri@ag.idaho.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Idaho

Philip Heimlich (IL Bar No. 6286375)
 Assistant Attorney General
 Elizabeth Blackston (IL Bar No. 6228859)
 Consumer Fraud Bureau Chief
 Office of the Illinois Attorney General
 500 S. Second Street
 Springfield, IL 62791
 Phone: (217) 782-4436
philip.heimlich@ilag.gov
elizabeth.blackston@ilag.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff People of the State of Illinois

Benjamin Bellus (IA Bar No. AT0000688)
 William Pearson (IA Bar No. AT0012070)
 Assistant Attorneys General
 Office of the Iowa Attorney General
 1305 E. Walnut St.
 Des Moines, IA 50319
 Phone: (515) 242-6536 (Bellus)
 (515) 242-6773 (Pearson)
 Fax: (515) 281-6771
Benjamin.Bellus@ag.iowa.gov
William.Pearson@ag.iowa.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Iowa

Nicholas C. Smith (KS Bar No. 29742)
 Sarah M. Dietz (KS Bar No. 27457)
 Assistant Attorneys General
 Consumer Protection Section
 Office of the Kansas Attorney General
 120 SW 10th Avenue, 2nd Floor
 Topeka, KS 66612
 Phone: (785) 296-3751
 Fax: (785) 291-3699

Nicholas.Smith@ag.ks.gov
sarah.dietz@ag.ks.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Kansas

Jonathan E. Farmer (KY Bar No. 91999)
 Deputy Executive Director of Consumer Protection
 Office of the Attorney General of Kentucky
 1024 Capital Center Drive, Ste. 200
 Frankfort, KY 40601
 Phone: (502) 696-5448
 Fax: (502) 573-8317
Jonathan.Farmer@ky.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff Commonwealth of Kentucky

ZaTabia N. Williams (LA Bar No. 36933)
 Assistant Attorney General
 Office of the Attorney General Liz Murrill
 1885 North Third St.
 Baton Rouge, LA 70802
 Phone: (225) 326-6164
 Fax: (225) 326-6499
WilliamsZ@ag.louisiana.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Louisiana

1 Brendan O'Neil (ME Bar No. 009900)
 2 Michael Devine (ME Bar No. 005048)
 3 Assistant Attorneys General
 4 Office of the Maine Attorney General
 5 6 State House Station
 6 Augusta, ME 04333
 7 Phone: (207) 626-8800
 8 Fax: (207) 624-7730
 9 brendan.oneil@maine.gov
 10 michael.devine@maine.gov
 11 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Maine*

12 Philip Ziperman (Fed. Bar No. 12430)
 13 Deputy Counsel
 14 Office of the Attorney General
 15 200 St. Paul Place
 16 Baltimore, MD 21202
 17 Phone: (410) 576-6417
 18 Fax: (410) 576-6566
 19 pziperman@oag.state.md.us
 20 *Attorney for Plaintiff Maryland Office of*
 21 *the Attorney General*

22 Carol Guerrero (MA Bar No. 705419)
 23 Assistant Attorney General
 24 Michael N. Turi (MA Bar No. 706205)
 25 Deputy Chief, Consumer Protection
 26 Division
 27 Massachusetts Office of the Attorney
 28 General
 One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor
 Boston, MA 02108
 Phone: (617) 963-2783
 Fax: (617) 727-5765
<mailto:Carol.Guerrero@mass.gov>
Michael.Turi@mass.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff Commonwealth of
Massachusetts

Kathy P. Fitzgerald (MI Bar No. P31454)
 Michael S. Hill (MI Bar No. P73084)
 Assistant Attorneys General
 Michigan Department of Attorney General
 Corporate Oversight Division
 P.O. Box 30736
 Lansing, MI 48909
 Phone: (517) 335-7632
 Fax: (517) 335-6755
fitzgeraldk@michigan.gov
Hillm19@michigan.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff People of the
State of Michigan

Bennett Hartz (MN Bar No. 0393136)
 Assistant Attorney General
 Office of the Minnesota Attorney General
 445 Minnesota Street, Suite 1200
 Saint Paul, MN 55404
 Phone: (651) 757-1235
bennett.hartz@ag.state.mn.us
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Minnesota,
by its Attorney General, Keith Ellison

James M. Rankin (MS Bar No. 102332)
 Special Assistant Attorney General
 Mississippi Attorney General's Office
 P.O. Box 220
 Jackson, MS 39205
 Phone: (601) 359-4258
james.rankin@ago.ms.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff Lynn Fitch,
Attorney General State of Mississippi

1 Eliot Gusdorf (MO Bar No. 73225)
 2 Assistant Attorney General
 3 Office of the Missouri Attorney General
 815 Olive Street, Suite 200
 4 St. Louis, MO 63101
 Phone: (314) 340-6816
 5 Fax: (314) 340-7891
eliot.gusdorf@ago.mo.gov
 6 *Attorney for Plaintiff State of Missouri, ex.*
rel. Catherine L. Hanaway, Attorney
 7 *General*

8 Brent Mead (MT Bar No. 68035000)
 9 Deputy Solicitor General
 10 Anna Schneider (MT Bar No. 13963)
 Special Assistant Attorney General, Senior
 11 Counsel
 12 Montana Attorney General's Office
 Office of Consumer Protection
 13 215 North Sanders Street
 P.O. Box 200151
 14 Helena, MT 59620-0151
 Phone: (406) 444-4500
 15 Brent.mead2@mt.gov
 16 Anna.schneider@mt.gov
 17 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Montana*

18 Gary E. Brollier (NE Bar No. 19785)
 19 Assistant Attorney General
 20 Office of the Attorney General Michael T.
 Hilgers
 21 2115 State Capitol Building
 Consumer Protection Division
 22 Lincoln, NE 68509
 Phone: (402) 471-1279
 23 Fax: (402) 471-4725
 24 gary.brollier@nebraska.gov
 25 *Attorney for Plaintiff State of Nebraska*

Michelle C. Badorine (NV Bar No. 13206)
 Senior Deputy Attorney General
 Office of the Nevada Attorney General
 Bureau of Consumer Protection
 100 North Carson Street
 Carson City, NV 89701-4717
 Phone: (775) 684-1164
 Fax: (775) 684-1299
MBadorine@ag.nv.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Nevada

Mary F. Stewart (NH Bar No. 10067)
 Assistant Attorney General
 New Hampshire Department of Justice
 Office of the Attorney General
 Consumer Protection and Antitrust Bureau
 1 Granite Place South
 Concord, NH 03301
 Phone: (603) 271-1139
Mary.F.Stewart@doj.nh.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of New
Hampshire

Blair Gerold (NJ Bar No. 294602019)
 Jeffrey Koziar (NJ Bar No. 015131999)
 Deputy Attorneys General
 New Jersey Office of the Attorney General
 Division of Law
 124 Halsey Street
 Newark, NJ 07101
 Phone: (609) 696-5363
 Fax: (973) 648-3879
Blair.Gerold@law.njoag.gov
Jeff.koziar@law.njoag.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff State of New Jersey

1 Billy Jimenez (NM Bar No. 144627)
 2 Assistant Attorney General
 3 New Mexico Department of Justice
 4 408 Galisteo St.
 5 Santa Fe, New Mexico 87501
 6 Phone: (505) 527-2694
 7 Fax: (505) 490-4883
 8 Bjimenez@nmdoj.gov
 9 *Attorney for Plaintiff Raúl Torrez, New*
 10 *Mexico Attorney General*

8 Glenna Goldis (NY Bar No. 4868600)
 9 Assistant Attorney General
 10 Office of the New York State Attorney
 11 General
 12 28 Liberty Street
 13 New York, NY 10005
 14 Phone: (646) 856-3697
 15 Glenna.goldis@ag.ny.gov
 16 *Attorney for Plaintiff Office of the Attorney*
 17 *General of the State of New York*

15 Elin S. Alm (ND Bar No. 05924)
 16 Christopher Glenn Lindblad (ND Bar
 17 No. 06480)
 18 Assistant Attorneys General
 19 Office of North Dakota Attorney General
 20 Consumer Protection & Antitrust Division
 21 1720 Burlington Drive, Suite C
 22 Bismarck, ND 58504-7736
 23 Phone: (701) 328-5570
 24 Fax: (701) 328-5568
 25 mailto:ealm@nd.gov
 26 clindblad@nd.gov
 27 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of North*
 28 *Dakota*

Sylvia Lanfair (OK Bar No. 30144)
 Assistant Attorney General
 Office of the Oklahoma Attorney General
 313 N.E. 21st St.
 Oklahoma City, OK 73105
 Phone: (405) 522- 8129
 Fax: (405) 522-0085
mailto:sylvia.lanfair@oag.ok.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Oklahoma ex
rel. Attorney General Gentner Drummond

Jordan M. Roberts (OR Bar No. 115010)
 Senior Assistant Attorney General
 Oregon Department of Justice
 Economic Justice Section
 100 SW Market St.
 Portland, OR 97201
 Phone: (971) 673-1880
 Fax: (971) 673-1884
jordan.m.roberts@doj.oregon.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Oregon

Mark W Wolfe (PA Bar No. 327807)
 Deputy Attorney General
 Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General
 Strawberry Square, 15th Floor
 Harrisburg, PA 17120-0001
 Phone: (717) 772-3558
 Fax: (717) 705-3795
mwolfe@attorneygeneral.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff Commonwealth of
Pennsylvania by Attorney General David
W. Sunday, Jr.

Stephen N. Provazza (RI Bar No. 10435)
 Assistant Attorney General
 Rhode Island Office of the Attorney
 General
 150 S. Main Street
 Providence, RI 02903
 Phone: (401) 274-4400, ext. 2476
 Fax: (401) 222-1766
sprovazza@riag.ri.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Rhode Island

Kristin Simons (SC Bar No. 74004)
 Senior Assistant Attorney General
 South Carolina Attorney General's Office
 P.O. Box 11549
 Columbia, SC 29211-1549
 Phone: (803) 734-6134
<mailto:ksimons@scag.gov>
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of South
 Carolina*

Austin C. Ostiguy (TN Bar No. 040301)
 Tyler T. Corcoran (TN Bar No. 038887)
 Assistant Attorneys General
 Office of the Tennessee Attorney General
 P.O. Box 20207
 Nashville, TN 37202
 Phone: (615) 532-7271 (Ostiguy)
 (615) 770-1714 (Corcoran)
 Fax: (615) 532-2910
austin.ostiguy@ag.tn.gov
tyler.corcoran@ag.tn.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Tennessee

David Shatto (Fed. Bar No. 3725697; TX
 Bar No. 24104114)
 Assistant Attorney General
 Attorney General for the State of Texas
 Office of the Attorney General
 P.O. Box 12548 (MC-010)
 Austin, TX 78711
 Phone: (512) 463-2185
 Fax: (512) 473-9125
David.Shatto@oag.texas.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Texas

Alexandra Butler (UT Bar No. 19238)
 Assistant Attorney General
 Utah Attorney General's Office
 160 East 300 South, 5th Floor
 P.O. Box 140872
 Salt Lake City, UT 84114-0872
 Phone: (385) 910-5533
 Fax: (801) 366-0315
alexandrabutler@agutah.gov
*Attorney for Plaintiff Utah Division of
 Consumer Protection*

James Layman (VT Bar No. 5236)
 Office of the Vermont Attorney General
 109 State Street
 Montpelier, VT 05609-1001
 Phone: (802) 828-2315
 Fax: (802) 304-1014
James.Layman@vermont.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Vermont

Geoffrey L. Ward (VA Bar No. 89818)
 Senior Assistant Attorney General
 Office of the Attorney General of Virginia
 202 N. Ninth St.
 Richmond, VA 23219
 Phone: (804) 371-0871
 Fax: (804) 786-0122
gward@oag.state.va.us
*Attorney for Plaintiff Commonwealth of
 Virginia, ex rel. Jason S. Miyares,
 Attorney General*

Zorba Leslie (WA Bar No. 58523)
 Assistant Attorney General
 Washington State Attorney General's
 Office
 800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000
 Seattle, WA 98104
 Phone: (206) 340-6787
 Fax: (206) 464-6451
zorba.leslie@atg.wa.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Washington

Ashley T. Wentz (WV Bar No. 13486)
 Assistant Attorney General
 West Virginia Attorney General's Office
 Consumer Protection/Antitrust Division
 P.O. Box 1789
 Charleston, WV 25326
 Phone: (304) 558-8986
 Fax: (304) 558-0184
Ashley.T.Wentz@wvago.gov
*Attorney for Plaintiff State of West
 Virginia ex rel. John B. McCuskey,
 Attorney General*

Gregory A. Myszkowski (WI Bar No.
 1050022)
 Assistant Attorney General
 Wisconsin Department of Justice
 P.O. Box 7857
 Madison, WI 53707-7857
 Phone: (608) 266-7656
 Fax: (608) 294-2907
gregory.myszkowski@wisdoj.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Wisconsin

Cameron W. Geeting (WY Bar No.
 7--5338)
 Senior Assistant Attorney General
 Consumer Protection and Antitrust Unit
 Wyoming Attorney General's Office
 2320 Capitol Avenue
 Cheyenne, Wyoming 82002
 Phone: (307) 777-3795
cameron.geeting1@wyo.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Wyoming